
Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

Participants

Christian Olesen (chairman), Alan McCulla, Alex Wiseman, Anne Mette Baek Jespersen, Audun Maråk, Björn Åsgård, Brian Isbister, Carmen Fernández, Christine Absil, Claus Reedtz Sparrevohn, Eibhlin O'Sullivan, Eric Roeleveld, Esben Sverdrup, Francis O'Donnell, Frank Minck, Frederik Schutyser, Fredrik Lindberg, Gavin Power, Gerard van Balsfoort, Ian Gatt, Iain MacSween, Ignacio Fontaneda López, Jean-Marie Robert, Jerome Nouis, Jesper Juul Larsen, John Ward, José Beltran, Laura Johnston, Lotte Worsøe Clausen, Mark Dickey-Collas, Marc Ghilia, Nico Bogaard, Niels Hintzen, Nils Christian Jensen, Piebe Hotsma, Reine J. Johansson, Rob Banning, Sarunas Zableckis, Sean O'Donoghue, Stewart Harper, Verena Ohms

(1) Opening of WG I meeting by the chairman, Christian Olesen

The chairman opened the meeting at 9.07 hrs and welcomed the participants. Subsequently everybody got the opportunity to introduce him- or herself.

(2) Approval of the agenda

The agenda was approved without amendments.

(3) Fishing opportunities for 2014 – Presentation of ICES advice by Carmen Fernández

The chairman invited Carmen Fernández to present the ICES advice on the relevant herring stocks.

She started by outlining the general steps in the ICES advisory process. Expert Groups conduct the assessment and provide the first draft of the advice which afterwards gets finalized in the Advice Drafting Groups before it is approved and released by ACOM. In addition benchmark workshops take place every few years which provide in-depth revisions of assessment methods, approved by external reviewers. Management plans form the basis of the ICES advice if they have been accepted by all competent authorities and are consistent with the precautionary approach. Where no management plan is available ICES advises on the basis of MSY or the transition to MSY so that MSY is reached by 2015. If MSY is unknown ICES advises on the basis of the precautionary approach. Carmen Fernández also explained that in 2012 ICES developed the approach to data-limited stocks to give quantitative advice for stocks for which no full analytical assessment is available. This approach will further be refined at WKLIFE3 in October 2013.

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

- **Western Baltic spring spawning herring**

ICES advises for 2014 on the basis of the transition to MSY that no more than 41.602 tons of WBSS herring should be caught in areas IVa East, IIIa and 22-24 assuming that all catches will be landed. While fishing mortality has decreased it is currently still above F_{msy} and SSB has been decreasing. Furthermore the stock seems in a low productivity phase although recruitment is estimated with high uncertainty. The benchmark carried out in 2013 changed the perception of the stock now assuming that it is in a poorer condition than previously thought. Reference points have been revised as well. F_{msy} is 0.28, $B_{lim} = 90$ kt and $B_{pa} = 110$ kt. The main issue with this stock is the summer feeding migration into Division IIIa and the eastern part of subarea IVa where it mixes with North Sea autumn spawning herring. There is also some mixing with Central Baltic herring in Subdivisions 24-26 which complicates the assessment. Area misreporting is no longer an issue and landings at age data have been corrected for historical area misreporting. Discards are not included in the assessment, but assumed to be small. There are 2 acoustic surveys, 2 trawl surveys and a larval survey which are used in the assessment. The fishery is very complex and consists of 4 different fleets. The C fleet is a directed fishery in Division IIIa. The D fleet is a bycatch fishery in the same area and both catch North Sea herring too. The F fleet comprises all fisheries in Subdivisions 22-24 while the A fleet is a directed herring fishery in the North Sea that mostly catches North Sea herring. The forecast assumes that 40% of the TAC in Division IIIa is taken in the North Sea in 2013.

Gerard van Balsfoort said that there was the possibility to transfer 50% of the quota for this stock into area IV and he wanted to know whether this created a problem for the North Sea herring stock.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen explained that the majority of the transfer is caught relatively far west and as long as the catches are mostly taken in the west there is no problem.

Gerard van Balsfoort thus concluded that fishing in IVa East still catches the WBSS herring stock, but that going further to the north would result in higher catches of North Sea herring which then would be a problem.

However, Reine Johansson disagreed since there is no fishing in the relevant months.

Sarunas Zableckis noticed that the advice was provided for all stocks, but the TACs for separate stocks and he wanted to know how the TACs were separated.

Carmen Fernández explained that the TACs are given by area and fleet, which involves catches of 2 stocks given that North Sea herring is partly also present in IIIa. Therefore some assumptions have to be made about this in the assessment. The advice, however, only considers WBSS herring in this area and not the other stocks. The sums with North Sea herring are presented, but only serve illustrative purpose.

Gerard van Balsfoort referred back to last year's meeting when there was an emotional debate about the 50% optional quota transfer. He noted that this year ICES

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

did not mention it. He said that ICES assumes a 50/50 split of WBSS and North Sea herring in area IIIa, but that in case managers allowed taking some of that TAC in another area the risk of taking too much North Sea herring would increase even though the TAC for WBSS herring is much smaller. He was dissatisfied with the general principle of the transfer.

Carmen Fernández replied that there seems to be some confusion with the different fleets etc. She pointed out that the catch options table in the WBSS herring advice is for this stock only and therefore she assumed that managers will take this into account when setting TACs and choose a larger number in the end. The WBSS herring TAC is not used to catch more North Sea herring. Last year ICES criticized the optionality of the transfer, because it added uncertainty to the assessment, but this year it has been agreed that the Pelagic RAC will provide information on the transfer beforehand.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen said that last year a lot of speculation had to be done for the intermediate year, because ICES did not know a number for the transfer. But this issue seemed solved since it was decided at the benchmark that the Pelagic RAC will provide estimates in the future. The 50/50 shift is something else and should not be confused with the transfer.

Reine Johansson acknowledged that the WBSS herring stock is a very complex stock to assess and manage and that ICES has continuously improved the assessment which he was very happy about.

The chairman wanted to know how much is known in terms of discards for this stock. Carmen Fernandez explained that ICES decided to give catch advice this year taking into account discards as much as possible. However, the amount of discards is generally so small that it can be reasonably assumed that all catches are landed.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen added that it was not possible to quantify discards, but that some information was available from the North Sea herring fishery.

• **North Sea herring**

The advice for North Sea herring follows the EU/Norway management plan with catches of no more than 482.477 tons including 470.037 tons for the A-fleet. The advice also says that seabed disturbing activities should not occur on herring spawning grounds, a recommendation that is repeated for the other herring stocks as well. Carmen Fernández explained that the benchmark in 2012 changed the overall level of the stock, while trends remained the same. SSB is much higher than previously thought while F is considered to be lower. However, the stock is still in a low recruitment phase. Carmen Fernández also summarized the results of the EU/Norway request to re-evaluate reference points and test different harvest control rules. The advice to this request has been issued in November 2012. The reference points were revised and Blim is now 800 kilo tons, Bpa 1 million tons and Fmsy is a range of 0.24-0.30 rather than a single value. The previous reference points for Flim and Fpa are no longer considered applicable and have been

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

discarded. The current management plan which was developed in 2008 is precautionary, but all other harvest control rules tested contain precautionary scenarios too. However, Carmen Fernández explained that managers could not agree on a new management plan and therefore ICES still based this year's advice on the 2008 management plan. The fishery is complex with four different fleets catching the stock that mixes with WBSS herring as she described previously. Discards are not believed to be widespread, but knowledge is limited. The forecast assumes that in 2013 40% of the TAC in division IIIa will be taken in the North Sea.

Ian Gatt wanted to know whether scientists were any closer to understanding why recruitment is still so low. Mark Dickey-Collas replied that even though more research has been done there are still no satisfying answers. He was very pleased with a paper recently published by Ad Corten clearly pinpointing that the problem lies in the larval phase, possibly due to cannibalism or phytoplankton change. However, at the moment it remains unknown why larvae are dying. He also pointed out that SSB is currently so high despite low recruitment due to a huge quota reduction previously.

The chairman remarked that discards have been reported in the B-fleet and he wondered whether discards might also occur in the A-fleet. He advised HAWG to have a closer look at this.

Niels Hintzen pointed out that IMARES does provide discard data for the A-fleet, because there is an observer program in The Netherlands. However, the discard rate is so low that it is not worth taking it into the assessment.

- **West of Scotland herring (VIa North)**

ICES advises that in accordance with the management plan landings should not exceed 28.067 tons while all catches are assumed to be landed and discards considered to be low. SSB and recruitment have been lower since 1977 and the late 1980ies respectively. Nevertheless, SSB has been stable for a long time and fishing mortality is around F_{msy} . In terms of biology this stock spawns in the autumn and partly mixes with neighbouring herring stocks. Since 2006 the fishery takes place mostly in the Northern part of VIa North in the 3rd quarter. Area misreporting into this area has been a problem in the past. The assessment uses landings at age data, an acoustic survey and biological information. There is a benchmark planned for 2015.

Sean O'Donoghue remarked that the ICES advice for the last 3 years has been stating that the mixing issue needs to be solved. He wanted to know how close people are to solving it and whether any progress has been made.

Carmen Fernández replied that the scientific work takes a long time, but that efforts have been taken to split the acoustic survey and separate out the different components within the survey. She assumed that people will try to resolve the issue until the benchmark takes place in 2015 when both this stock and the West of Ireland stock will be dealt with.

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

Lotte Worsøe Clausen pointed out that scientists would like to have more than 2 years of data for the split and that more stocks are affected by the mixing. Mark Dickey-Collas added that this is a complicated issue to work on for which no funding is available.

Claus Reedtz Sparrevohn wondered how it was possible to have Blim, but not Bpa. He thought that there was a standard procedure for deriving Bpa from Blim.

Carmen Fernandez did not know why this procedure has not been applied for this herring stock, but assumed that this will be dealt with at the benchmark too.

Ian Gatt explained that part of the MSC certification process is to get all reference points.

- **VIa South, VIIb,c herring**

ICES advises on the basis of the precautionary approach that there should be no catches unless a rebuilding plan is implemented. Discards are assumed to be low. There are two exploratory assessments for this stock which show different trends in recent years, but both assume SSB to be very low. The revised rebuilding plan proposed by the Pelagic RAC in 2012 has not been evaluated by ICES. The fishery is only for human consumption and uses pelagic trawling in quarters 1 and 4. The assessments are only exploratory and use landings at age data, an acoustic survey and biological information. The stock is going to be benchmarked in 2015.

Sean O'Donoghue said that this advice was becoming an annual copy/paste exercise and that the ICES advice was useless, because it seemed that the Commission has chosen STECF to deal with this stock rather than ICES. He also said that the graphs in terms of recruitment, F and SSB did not reflect the reality since there was a huge recruitment in 2008 which does not show up in the graphs. The fishery used to be a 5 months fishery in 2003-2004 which has now been reduced to only 1 week and therefore cannot deliver meaningful data anymore. He wanted to know from the Commission whether ICES will be involved in the evaluation of the management plan or whether this will be left to STECF. He furthermore pointed out that the assessment due to the mixing issue was useless as well and that the only valuable information comes from the fishing industry which is not enough, because the stock may hardly been fished at all. He admitted that this stock is very small and only fished by the Irish fleet, but he was very concerned that it might turn into a WBSS herring equivalent.

Carmen Fernández replied that she and everybody else in ICES were aware of these comments as they have been raised previously. At the same time she pointed out that scientists try hard with the limited information available to provide an assessment and advice for this stock which fits the information scientists have. She explained that the advice will not change unless more information becomes available. Regarding the evaluation of the management plan she did not know why the Commission has approached STECF rather than ICES to perform the evaluation.

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

Mark Dickey-Collas said that it was official EU policy to consult STECF regarding stocks which occur only in EU waters. ICES, on the other hand, is consulted when dealing with stocks which are effected by 3rd countries too.

Frederik Schutyser explained that the Commission had decided to submit the revised rebuilding plan to STECF, because STECF has already done some work on the previous version of the plan and is familiar with it. If time allows the Commission will also send the plan to ICES after STECF has finished its current work. Otherwise the STECF evaluation can be used to propose a TAC.

Sean O'Donoghue wanted to know whether ICES will be in a position to give advice in November after STECF has evaluated the plan. He also stressed that the working group reports have talked about significant recruitment in some years, but none of this is displayed in the graphs.

Carmen Fernández responded that it will be difficult for ICES to react to the STECF evaluation in time as there are too little resources available. In terms of recruitment she said that when recruitment does not seem reliable it is estimated to be an average of previous years and this is what happened here, because there are not enough fishery-independent data available.

However, Sean O'Donoghue objected that the high recruitment which supposedly has been averaged out occurred in 2008/2009 which should really be showing up now. He was deeply concerned about scientists claiming the opposite of what is observed by fishermen.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen was certain that all available data have been used, also recruitment data from 2008/2009, but Sean O'Donoghue was convinced that he was right and wondered whether the mixing issue might hide recruitment.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen replied that the assessments are not taken into account when issuing advice, because they are exploratory and show different signals. The advice is only based on signals which ICES is sure about, i.e. low SSB. She suggested asking HAWG to take up this issue by sending a letter and assured the meeting that any input is highly appreciated, but has to be provided in a collaborative process.

- **Celtic Sea herring**

ICES advises on the basis of the MSY approach that catches should be no more than 35.942 tons. Discards are considered to be low and all catches are assumed to be landed. The stock is in a good condition with SSB being at the highest peak in the entire time series, high recruitment and F below F_{msy}. In 2011 the Pelagic RAC came up with a management plan which ICES evaluated to be precautionary in 2012. Therefore the ICES advice could also have been based on the management plan. However, Carmen Fernández explained that the Commission indicated preference for MSY rather than the management plan. In terms of biology this stock spawns from October until February. A part of the juveniles are in the

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

Irish Sea, but return to the Celtic Sea to spawn. The spawning grounds are inshore, close to the coast and on gravel or flat stone. Juvenile herring may be caught in the sprat fishery and sprat landings have increased substantially. Some misreporting of sprat and herring occurs. There is a high uncertainty in recruitment estimation and based on an acoustic survey SSB has increased substantially in 2012. The assessment uses landings at age data, an acoustic survey and biological information. A benchmark is planned for 2014.

Eibhlin O'Sullivan wondered why the Commission uttered preference for MSY rather than the management plan. She also said that sometimes ICES talks about catch and sometimes landings. She assumed that both just mean a TAC figure even though the terms are used interchangeably. Finally she wanted to know where the sprat information was coming from.

Frederik Schutyser said that the Commission preferred MSY in order to be consistent for all stocks. MSY is also preferred in the policy statement, because overall MSY should always be prioritized. However, everything that is provided in the catch options table might in the end be used for proposing a TAC.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen explained that the sprat information was provided by the Marine Institute and during the sprat benchmark.

Sean O'Donoghue expressed confusion regarding the Commission's position. While he would love to get a high TAC increase he felt that following MSY was not consistent with the Commission strongly promoting management plans in the past. He wanted to receive clarification on this issue. He furthermore pointed out that this year's advice has considerably changed in terms of what is said about discards, but this correction is not mentioned. While last year the advice stated that discards are a problem for this stock this year it only says that discards are low. He also noted that all herring stocks are doing quite well except for VIa South which according to ICES is collapsing. This seemed very unusual to him.

Carmen Fernández replied that in 2010/2011 discards were thought to be higher due to a different quota system. As this has changed in 2012 discards now seem to be lower. However, Sean O'Donoghue was unhappy about the way this was written in last year's advice while indeed this year the advice is more nuanced.

Mark Dickey-Collas explained that only 3 countries have provided discard data: The Netherlands, Scotland and Germany and the reason the whole story is more nuanced is simply because very little information is available. The situation is completely vague and will remain so until people provide reliable data. (He emphasized that he contributed this comment as ex IMARES member and not as ICES representative.)

Eibhlin O'Sullivan said that even though Mark Dickey-Collas might be correct the industry raised the issue that last year's advice was not nuanced at all, but very clearly stated that there was a discard problem because the question was why ICES assumed that this was the case.

Sean O'Donoghue still wanted to know how ICES handles corrections of mistakes in previous years.

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

Carmen Fernandez replied that things like catch numbers are always corrected right away, because numbers are easy to correct. However, less clear cases and where knowledge evolves qualitatively, but not quantitatively are more difficult to deal with. She promised to raise this point with ACOM.

Sean O'Donoghue summarized that the 2010/2011 advice states that there was a high discard problem, while the current advice says that discards are low. As history moves on people in a few years will assume that in 2010/2011 there was indeed a discard problem which is not correct. Therefore he wondered whether ICES has a correction mechanism for this kind of issues.

According to Mark Dickey-Collas ICES tries to address these things in the following year. However, ICES is under huge pressure and does not have the resources available to go back to advice from a few years ago and update this too.

Frederik Schutyser mentioned that management plans are currently in a grey area due to the deadlock between the Council and the Parliament and that at the moment it is not clear yet what will be in the final TAC proposal.

Christian Olesen said that from a Pelagic RAC point of view the Commission should either go with the management plan or with MSY and to clearly communicate this to ICES.

- **Irish Sea herring**

ICES advises on the basis of MSY that catches should be no more than 5.251 tons. Discards are considered to be low and all catches are assumed to be landed. SSB has been above MSY Btrigger and recruitment above average since 2006. F is now at Fmsy. The stock mixes with other stocks in the West of Scotland and with juvenile Celtic Sea herring in the Irish Sea. The fishery consists mainly of pelagic trawl in quarters 3 and 4, but there is also a small, local gillnet fishery in quarter 4. Migration patterns vary annually which can lead to changes in the selectivity of the fishery and the survey which sometimes causes a mismatch between survey timing and migration pattern. However, the overall sampling coverage is good. The assessment uses landings at age data, acoustic and larvae surveys and biological information. Carmen Fernández pointed out that there are some mistakes in the percentage numbers of the published outlook table which is currently being corrected.

Eibhlin O'Sullivan wanted to know whether the current advice will therefore disappear and how one can know whether an advice has been amended.

Carmen Fernandez replied that if things like catch advice are corrected the new summary sheet would, to her knowledge, say corrected. However, if only the percentages are changed, this will probably not be explicitly stated in the advice. Nevertheless, she promised to bring this question to the attention of ACOM.

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

(4) Adoption of Pelagic RAC advice

- **Western Baltic spring spawning herring**

The chairman explained that in 2013 the EU and Norway decided to establish a Working Group dealing with management measures for herring in IIIa where catches consist of different herring stocks. At a meeting of this Working Group in June Norway proposed setting the TAC in IIIa as the sum of a fixed percentage of the TAC for North Sea herring and a fixed percentage of the ICES advice for WBSS herring. The chairman suspected that several more meetings will take place before a final decision will be taken. Therefore he did not see much point in giving a TAC figure while the EU and Norway are still in the negotiating process and suggested postponing this decision to the October meeting.

Reine Johansson supported this suggestion and said that the Baltic Sea RAC would do the same. He expected a decision by the Working Group in August and even though the RACs were not invited to the meetings he was satisfied with the process, because updates were received.

- **North Sea herring**

The chairman pointed out that the situation for North Sea herring is more or less the same as for WBSS herring. The EU and Norway are trying to agree on a new management plan and a meeting between both parties is in the planning. The chairman hence suggested giving a TAC figure for this stock in October when more information should be available.

- **West of Scotland herring**

The meeting agreed to follow the management plan for this stock. Ian Gatt added that the Pelagic RAC should also write a sentence regarding the work which is needed on reference points before the benchmark in 2015.

- **VIa South VIIb,c herring**

The chairman recalled that there was a political issue between Ireland and Scotland regarding this stock and wanted to know whether it has been resolved.

Sean O'Donoghue replied that the issue was about a closure that is part of the proposed rebuilding plan. There have been no detailed discussions yet between Ireland and the UK, but he was confident that any concerns can be resolved. However, he first

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

wanted to wait until STECF has evaluated the rebuilding plan. STECF found a few errors in the plan which have to be corrected and Maurice Clarke might be able to help with this. The revised plan will probably have to be agreed by the Pelagic RAC through written procedure afterwards. In his understanding STECF will perform a full evaluation in November and if the closure will be judged useful, this issue can be discussed between UK and Ireland. He suggested discussing this herring stock again at the October meeting and also pointed out that there will be an informal meeting with the Commission on how to follow up on this further.

The chairman concluded that this stock will be postponed until October, but that Sean O'Donoghue will have a look at the technical aspects of the plan before October.

- **Celtic Sea herring**

The chairman proposed following the management plan.

Sean O'Donoghue wanted to seek clarification from the Commission on when a management plan should be followed. He pointed out that the plan for this stock has been evaluated as precautionary by both STECF and ICES.

- **Irish Sea herring**

The chairman summarized that the Pelagic RAC was in the process of developing a management plan for this stock and suggested following MSY until a plan is available. The meeting agreed.

(5) Presentation by Lotte Worsøe Clausen on herring spawning grounds

Lotte Worsøe Clause, one of the co-chairs of HAWG, gave a presentation based on the letter previously sent by the Pelagic RAC asking for clarification on what is meant in the ICES advice by sea-bottom disturbing activities and on the location of herring spawning grounds. She said that HAWG realized that the previous formulation needed tightening and "activities" has therefore been changed to "anthropogenic influences other than traditional fishing". She also said that HAWG ended up with more work than anticipated, because suddenly people want to know where the spawning grounds are and why they should be spared. HAWG was therefore very happy that the Pelagic RAC offered support to answering these questions. She further explained that HAWG started a working document which contains all knowledge so far and the plan is to present this to the Pelagic RAC once it is finished and update the document with knowledge from the RAC. Subsequently this document will form the basis for further exploration for hitherto un-described spawning

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

grounds and a collaborative project between the Pelagic RAC and relevant scientific institutes. She presented a map of the North Sea which is rather well examined regarding the spatial distribution of spawning grounds. Nevertheless she pointed out that HAWG was keen on receiving as much additional information as possible from fishermen and to combine all available knowledge. Lotte Worsøe Clausen also pointed out that HAWG provides advice on marine construction sites even though it has not been asked to do so. The reason for this is that a number of applications is coming out for salmon farms which might be close to herring spawning grounds and which therefore could turn into a problem at some point. It is therefore necessary to think about marine spatial planning. HAWG also put forward several questions to experts, especially WGEXT, including the completeness of spawning grounds identified, the flexibility of choosing spawning sites, what the effect of gravel extraction and similar activities is on spawning grounds and how long it takes for a spawning ground to recover. In summary the next steps will be to arrange a mapping session between HAWG and the Pelagic RAC, receive a reply from WGEXT, perform a literature study on spawning behaviour and seek funding for future work.

The chairman thanked Lotte Worsøe Clausen for her presentation and assured the collaboration with the Pelagic RAC. He promised to find skippers who might have significant knowledge on herring spawning ground locations.

Claus Reedt Sparrevohn said that it might be very interesting to look into the behaviour of the fish. It is known that spawning areas of pacific salmon deteriorate more at large spawning stock size which in turn has a negative effect on the number of recruits and he wondered whether anything is known about herring spawning behaviour.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen replied that some work has been done on density dependence which showed that if too many eggs are laid upon each other the eggs do not get enough oxygen and die.

Mark Dickey-Collas noted that it is very timely to start working on marine spatial planning and for the Pelagic RAC to work together with scientists on the questions related to herring spawning grounds. He explained that the mining industry noticed the ICES advice as well and started asking for scientific justification and pushed their ministers to question the advice.

Sean O'Donoghue asked whether ICES was also looking at seismic surveys, but Lotte Worsøe Clausen did not know. She said that WGEXT primarily deals with gravel extraction and seabed disturbance.

Christine Absil remarked that the most obvious disturbance is by demersal trawls and she wanted to know what the effect of those is.

Lotte Worsøe Clausen responded that to her knowledge these activities do not cause more harm than a very windy period. However, scientists were also looking into developing a scale of seriousness.

Gerard van Balsfoort offered to involve skippers who might have information on spawning grounds in the process. He has been told that herring spawns at places where warm and cold water come together and he wondered whether spawning grounds might be

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

changing due to differences in water temperature. He furthermore noticed that The Netherlands has a rather big gravel extraction industry and he worried that gravel extraction might lead to years of impaired visibility caused by continuous dredging. He wanted to know what would happen if herring cannot see each other anymore.

Ian Gatt explained that the amount of proposed development especially in the new energy sector is incredible while herring is a very important species to fish. Therefore he supported the efforts by HAWG and the Pelagic RAC to clarify the issues related to the spawning grounds. He said that most of the North Sea has been searched for oil or used for new energy and that impact assessments should be available. He suggested trying to get their maps.

The chairman concluded that a meeting between the Pelagic RAC and HAWG will be organized in the near future.

(6) Question round/discussion

There were no further questions.

(7) A.O.B.

There was no other business.

(8) End of WG I meeting

The chairman closed the meeting at 12.31 hrs.

Location: West-Indisch Huis, Amsterdam, NL (Herenmarkt 99, Tel: +31 20 625 7528)

Date: 2 July 2013

Start time: 9:00

End time: 12:30

More info: see www.pelagic-rac.org

Annex I: action list

- Raise with ACOM how corrections of ICES advice are handled (Carmen Fernández)
- Provide TAC advice for West of Scotland herring, Celtic Sea herring and Irish Sea herring (Executive Committee) ✓
- Revisit North Sea herring, WBSS herring and VIa South, VIIb,c herring in October meeting (Working Group I)
- Revise rebuilding plan for VIa South, VIIb,c herring (Sean O'Donoghue) and submit to Executive Committee for approval through written procedure (Secretariat) ✓
- Resolve area closure issue between UK and Ireland for VIa South, VIIb,c herring (Sean O'Donoghue, Ian Gatt) ✓
- Include a sentence on work needed on reference points for herring in VIa North (West of Scotland herring) in Pelagic RAC advice (Secretariat, Ian Gatt) ✓
- Seek clarification from Commission on when a management plan should be followed and when MSY (Sean O'Donoghue)
- Try to get maps of impact assessments from energy sector (Ian Gatt)
- Convene mapping meeting between the Pelagic RAC and HAWG (Christian Olesen, Lotte Worsøe Clausen, Secretariat)